

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 4

In the Matter of:

Clean Harbors Tennessee, LLC

Respondent.

Docket No. TSCA-04-2022-3200(b)

CONSENT AGREEMENT**I. NATURE OF ACTION**

1. This is an administrative penalty assessment proceeding brought under Section 16(a) of the Toxic Substances Control Act (TSCA or the Act), 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), and Sections 22.13(b) and 22.18 of the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules), as codified at Title 40 of the Code of Federal Regulations (C.F.R.), Part 22.
2. This Consent Agreement and the attached Final Order shall collectively be referred to as the CAFO.
3. Having found that settlement is consistent with the provisions and objectives of the Act and applicable regulations, the Parties have agreed to settle this action pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.18 and consent to the entry of this CAFO without adjudication of any issues of law or fact herein.

II. PARTIES

4. Complainant is the Director of the Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division, Region 4, who has been delegated the authority on behalf of the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency to enter into this CAFO pursuant to 40 C.F.R. Part 22 and Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a).
5. Respondent is Clean Harbors Tennessee, LLC (Respondent or CHT), a Polychlorinated Biphenyl (PCB) commercial storage facility operating in the State of Tennessee. CHT operates a facility located at 2815 Old Greenbrier Pike, Greenbrier, Tennessee (Facility).

III. GOVERNING LAW

6. Pursuant to Section 6(e) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2605, the Administrator of the EPA promulgated regulations in 40 C.F.R. Part 761 pertaining to PCBs. Failure to comply with any such rule constitutes a violation of Section 15 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2614. Any person who violates Section 15 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2614, may be assessed a civil penalty in accordance with Section 16(a) of

TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), and 40 C.F.R. Part 19, as amended. Each day a violation continues may constitute a separate violation.

7. The term “PCB waste” is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 761.3, as those PCBs and PCB items that are subject to the disposal requirements of subpart D of this part.
8. The term “Commercial storer of PCB waste” is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 761.3, as the owner or operator of each facility that is subject to the PCB storage unit standards of 40 C.F.R. § 761.65(b)(1) or (c)(7) or meets the alternate storage criteria of 40 C.F.R. § 761.65(b)(2), and who engages in storage activities involving either PCB waste generated by others or that was removed while servicing the equipment owned by others and brokered for disposal.
9. The term “Storage for disposal” is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 761.3, as temporary storage of PCBs that have been designated for disposal.
10. The term “Facility” is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 761.3, as all contiguous land, and structures, other appurtenances, and improvements on the land, used for the treatment, storage, or disposal of PCB waste. A facility may consist of one or more treatment, storage, or disposal units.
11. The term “PCB Items” is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 761.3, as any PCB Article, PCB Article Container, PCB Container, PCB Equipment, or anything that deliberately or unintentionally contains or has as a part of it any PCB or PCBs.
12. The term “PCB and PCBs” is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 761.3, as any chemical substance that is limited to the biphenyl molecule that has been chlorinated to varying degrees or any combination of substances which contains such substance.
13. The term “Manifest” is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 761.3, as the shipping document EPA form 8700-22 and any continuation sheet attached to EPA form 8700-22, originated and signed by the generator of PCB waste in accordance with the instructions included with the form and subpart K of this part.
14. The term “Annual Document Log” is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 761.3, as the detailed information maintained at the facility on the PCB waste handling at the facility.
15. The term “Annual Report” is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 761.3, as the written document submitted each year by each disposer and commercial storer of PCB waste to the appropriate EPA Regional Administrator. The annual report is a brief summary of the information included in the annual document log.

IV. FINDINGS OF FACTS

16. On August 9, 2019, the EPA issued an Approval to CHT to operate the commercial PCB waste storage Facility located in Greenbriar, Tennessee pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 761.65 and Section 6(e)(1) of TSCA. This Approval is based upon CHT’s Application for an Approval dated April 29, 2015, and updated on May 29, 2019 and June 24, 2019. The current Approval expires ten (10) years from the date the Approval became effective.

17. On September 16, 2021, authorized agents of the EPA conducted an inspection at CHT's Facility pursuant to Section 15 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2614, to determine the Facility's compliance with the PCB regulations.
18. Pursuant to Condition B.I(b) of the Approval, PCBs or PCB Items are required to be stored only in areas described in the Approval.
19. A review of CHT's records during the inspection showed that the PCB waste included in the following manifests related to off-site shipment had been stored at the Facility in areas other than the two (2) approved PCB storage areas for greater than ten (10) days as required by 40 C.F.R. § 761.65(b)(2), Approval Condition B.I(b), and Section 15 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2614:
 - a. Manifest Number 006836251GBF stored on-site from July 29, 2021 to August 9, 2021;
 - b. Manifest Number 015809608 FLE stored on-site from May 27, 2021 to June 10, 2021;
 - c. Manifest Number 015523335 FLE stored on-site from May 5, 2021 to June 10, 2021;
 - d. Manifest Number 015522978 FLE stored on-site from March 25, 2021 to April 9, 2021;
 - e. Manifest Number 015454470 FLE stored on-site from November 21, 2020 to December 2, 2020;
 - f. Manifest Number 015215590 FLE stored on-site from November 20, 2020 to December 2, 2020;
 - g. Manifest Number 015247695 FLE stored on-site from October 22, 2020 to November 7, 2020;
 - h. Manifest Number 015282139 FLE stored on-site from September 8, 2020 to September 20, 2020;
 - i. Manifest Number 015282235 FLE stored on-site from September 24, 2020 to October 14, 2020;
 - j. Manifest Number 015282140 FLE stored on-site from September 8, 2020 to October 9, 2020;
 - k. Manifest Number 015282236 FLE stored on-site from September 24, 2020 to October 8, 2020;
 - l. Manifest Number 015282081FLE stored on-site from August 27, 2020 to September 12, 2020;
 - m. Manifest Number 014120189FLE stored on-site from November 21, 2019 to December 2, 2019; and
 - n. Manifest Number McMinnSG stored on-site from October 6, 2018 to October 17, 2018.
20. Pursuant to Condition I of the Approval, CHT must comply with all applicable recordkeeping and reporting requirements of the PCB regulations for the PCBs or PCB Items stored on-site greater than ten (10) days, including but not limited to, annual records, annual document logs, and annual report as required by 40 C.F.R. § 761.180. CHT is also required to maintain daily records of storage inventories for the PCBs or PCB Items stored on-site greater than ten (10) days.
21. At the time of the inspection, CHT had failed to submit Annual Reports for 2018, 2019, and 2020 as required by 40 C.F.R. § 761.180, Approval Condition I, and Section 15 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2614.

V. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

22. The EPA alleges that Respondent failed to store PCB Waste in approved storage areas in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 761.65(b)(2), Approval Condition B.I(b), and Section 15 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2614.
23. The EPA alleges that Respondent failed to submit Annual Reports for 2018, 2019, and 2020 to the EPA in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 761.180, Approval Condition I, and Section 15 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2614.

VI. STIPULATIONS

24. The issuance of this CAFO simultaneously commences and concludes this proceeding pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b).
25. For the purpose of this proceeding, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(b)(2), Respondent:
 - a. admits that the EPA has jurisdiction over the subject matter alleged in this CAFO;
 - b. neither admits nor denies the factual allegations set forth in Section IV (Findings of Facts) of this CAFO;
 - c. consents to the assessment of a civil penalty as stated below;
 - d. consents to the conditions specified in this CAFO;
 - e. waives any right to contest the allegations set forth in Section V (Alleged Violations) of this CAFO; and
 - f. waives its rights to appeal the Final Order accompanying this CAFO.
26. For the purpose of this proceeding, Respondent:
 - a. agrees that this CAFO states a claim upon which relief may be granted against Respondent;
 - b. acknowledges that this CAFO constitutes an enforcement action for purposes of considering Respondent's compliance history in any subsequent enforcement actions;
 - c. waives any rights it may possess at or in equity to challenge the authority of the EPA to bring a civil action in a United States District Court to compel compliance with the CAFO, and to seek an additional penalty for such noncompliance, and agree that federal law shall govern in any such civil action;
 - d. by executing this CAFO, certifies to the best of its knowledge that Respondent is currently in compliance with all relevant requirements of the Act and its implementing regulations, and that all violations alleged herein, which are neither admitted nor denied, have been corrected;
 - e. waives any right it may have pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.8 to be present during any discussions with, or to be served with and reply to, any memorandum or communication

addressed to EPA officials where the purpose of such discussion, memorandum, or communication is to persuade such official to accept and issue this CAFO; and

f. agrees to comply with the terms of the CAFO.

27. Respondent reserves its rights to dispute the findings of fact and alleged violations in any future proceedings other than enforcement of this CAFO.

28. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.5, the individuals named in the certificate of service are authorized to receive service related to this proceeding and the parties agree to receive service by electronic means.

VII. TERMS OF PAYMENT

29. Respondent is assessed a civil penalty of **THIRTY-FOUR THOUSAND, NINE HUNDRED DOLLARS (\$34,900.00)**, which shall be paid within thirty (30) calendar days of the Effective Date of this CAFO.

30. Payment shall be made by cashier's check, certified check, by electronic funds transfer (EFT), or by Automated Clearing House (ACH) (also known as REX or remittance express). If paying by check, the check shall be payable to: Treasurer, United States of America, and the Facility name and docket number for this matter shall be referenced on the face of the check. If Respondent(s) send(s) payment by the U.S. Postal Service, the payment shall be addressed to:

United States Environmental Protection Agency
Fines and Penalties
Cincinnati Finance Center
P.O. Box 979077
St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000

If Respondent sends payment by non-U.S. Postal express mail delivery, the payment shall be sent to:

U.S. Bank
Government Lockbox 979077
U.S. EPA Fines & Penalties
1005 Convention Plaza
Mail Code: SL-MO-C2-GL
St. Louis, Missouri 63101
Contact number: (314) 425-1819

If paying by EFT, Respondent shall transfer the payment to:

Federal Reserve Bank of New York
ABA: 021030004
Account Number: 68010727
SWIFT address: FRNYUS33
33 Liberty Street
New York, New York 10045

Field Tag 4200 of the Fedwire message should read:
"D 68010727 Environmental Protection Agency"

If paying by ACH, Respondent shall remit payment to:

US Treasury REX / Cashlink ACH Receiver
ABA: 051036706
Account Number: 310006, Environmental Protection Agency
CTX Format Transaction Code 22 – checking Physical
location of US Treasury facility:
5700 Rivertech Court
Riverdale, Maryland 20737
Contact: John Schmid, (202) 874-7026
REX (Remittance Express): 1-866-234-5681

31. Respondent shall send proof of payment within 24 hours of payment of the civil penalty, to:

Regional Hearing Clerk
U.S. EPA Region 4
61 Forsyth Street, S.W.
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960
R4_Regional_Hearing_Clerk@epa.gov

and

Kris Lippert
U.S. EPA Region 4
61 Forsyth Street, S.W.
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960
lippert.kristin@epa.gov

32. "Proof of payment" means, as applicable, a copy of the check, confirmation of credit card or debit card payment, confirmation of wire or automated clearinghouse transfer, and any other information required to demonstrate that payment has been made according to the EPA requirements, in the amount due, and identified with the Facility name and "Docket No. TSCA-04-2022-3200(b)."
33. Pursuant to Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), 31 U.S.C. § 3717, 31 C.F.R. § 901.9, and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11, if Respondent fails to remit the civil penalty as agreed to herein, the EPA is entitled to assess interest and penalties on debts owed to the United States and a charge to cover the costs of processing and handling the delinquent claim. Accordingly, the EPA may require Respondent to pay the following amounts on any amount overdue:
- a. Interest. Interest will begin to accrue on the civil penalty from the Effective Date of this CAFO. If the civil penalty is paid within 30 days of the Effective Date of this CAFO, Interest is waived. However, if the civil penalty is not paid in full within 30 days of the Effective Date of this CAFO, Interest will continue to accrue on any unpaid portion until the unpaid portion of the civil penalty and accrued Interest are paid. Interest will be

assessed at the rate of the United States Treasury tax and loan rate, as established by the Secretary of the Treasury, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 3717(a)(1), 31 C.F.R. § 901.9(b)(2), and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(a).

- b. Non-Payment Penalty. On any portion of a civil penalty more than ninety (90) calendar days past due, Respondent must pay a non-payment penalty of not more than six percent (6%) per annum, which will accrue from the date the penalty payment became due and is not paid, as provided in 31 U.S.C. § 3717(e)(2) and 31 C.F.R. § 901.9(d). This non-payment penalty is in addition to charges which accrue or may accrue under subparagraphs (a) and (c) and will be assessed monthly. 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(c).
- c. Monthly Handling Charge. Respondent must pay a late payment handling charge to cover the administrative costs of processing and handling the delinquent claim, based on either actual or average cost incurred. 31 C.F.R. § 901.9(c), and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(b). Administrative costs will be assessed monthly throughout the period the debt is overdue except as provided by 40 C.F.R. § 13.12.

34. In addition to what is stated in the prior Paragraph, if Respondent fails to timely pay any portion of the penalty assessed under this CAFO, the EPA may:

- a. refer the debt to a credit reporting agency or a collection agency 40 C.F.R. §§ 13.13 and 13.14;
- b. collect the debt by administrative offset (i.e., the withholding of money payable by the United States to, or held by the United States for, a person to satisfy the debt the person owes the Government), which includes, but is not limited to, referral to the Internal Revenue Service for offset against income tax refunds, 40 C.F.R. Part 13, Subparts C and H;
- c. suspend or revoke Respondent's licenses or other privileges, or suspend or disqualify Respondent from doing business with the EPA or engaging in programs the EPA sponsors or funds, 40 C.F.R. § 13.17; and/or
- d. request that the Attorney General bring a civil action in the appropriate district court to recover the amount assessed, in addition to the amounts described above. In any such judicial action, the validity, amount, and appropriateness of the penalty and of this CAFO shall not be subject to review. Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a).

35. Penalties paid pursuant to this CAFO shall not be deductible for purposes of federal taxes.

VIII. EFFECT OF CAFO

36. This CAFO constitutes a settlement by the EPA of all claims for federal civil penalties pursuant to Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), for the specific violations alleged herein.

37. Full payment of the civil penalty, as provided in Section VII (Terms of Payment), shall not in any case affect the right of the EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violations of law. 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(c).

38. Any violation of this CAFO may result in a civil judicial action for civil penalties as provided in Section 16(a) of the Act, 42 U.S.C. § 2615(a), as well as criminal sanctions as provided in Section 16(b) of the Act, 42 U.S.C. § 2615(b). The EPA may use any information submitted under this CAFO in an administrative, civil judicial, or criminal action.
39. Nothing in this CAFO shall relieve Respondent of the duty to comply with all applicable provisions of the Act and other federal, state, or local laws or statutes, nor shall it restrict the EPA's authority to seek compliance with any applicable laws or regulations, nor shall it be construed to be a ruling on, or determination of, any issue related to any federal, state, or local permit, except as expressly provided herein.
40. Nothing herein shall be construed to limit the power of the EPA to undertake any action against Respondent or any person in response to conditions that may present an imminent and substantial endangerment as provided under the Act.
41. The terms, conditions, and compliance requirements of this CAFO may not be modified or amended except upon the written agreement of both (the) Parties, and approval of the Regional Judicial Officer.
42. The provisions of this CAFO shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent and its officers, directors, employees, agents, trustees, authorized representatives, successors, and assigns.
43. Any change in the legal status of Respondent, or change in ownership, partnership, corporate or legal status relating to the Facility, will not in any way alter Respondent's obligations and responsibilities under this CAFO.
44. By signing this Consent Agreement, Respondent acknowledges that this CAFO will be available to the public and agrees that this CAFO does not contain any confidential information under Section 14 of TSCA, 42 U.S.C. § 2613, and 40 C.F.R. Part 2 and the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) or personally identifiable information.
45. By signing this Consent Agreement, Complainant and the undersigned representative of Respondent each certify that he or she is fully authorized to execute and enter into the terms and conditions of this CAFO and has the legal capacity to bind the party he or she represents to this CAFO.
46. By signing this Consent Agreement, both Parties agree that each party's obligations under this CAFO constitute sufficient consideration for the other party's obligations.
47. By signing this Consent Agreement, Respondent certifies that the information it has supplied concerning this matter was at the time of submission, and continues to be, true, accurate, and complete for each such submission, response, and statement. Respondent acknowledges that there are significant penalties for submitting false or misleading information, including the possibility of fines and imprisonment for knowing submission of such information, under 18 U.S.C. § 1001.
48. The EPA also reserves the right to revoke this CAFO and settlement penalty if and to the extent that the EPA finds, after signing this CAFO, that any information provided by Respondent was materially false or inaccurate at the time such information was provided to the EPA. If such false or

inaccurate material was provided, the EPA reserves the right to assess and collect all civil penalties for any violation described herein. The EPA shall give Respondent notice of its intent to revoke, which shall not be effective until received by Respondent in writing.

49. It is the intent of the parties that the provisions of this CAFO are severable. If any provision or authority of this CAFO or the application of this CAFO to any party or circumstances is held by any judicial or administrative authority to be invalid or unenforceable, the application of such provisions to other parties or circumstances and the remainder of the CAFO shall remain in force and shall not be affected thereby.
50. Unless specifically stated otherwise in this CAFO, each party shall bear its own attorney's fees, costs, and disbursements incurred in this proceeding.

IX. EFFECTIVE DATE

51. This CAFO shall become effective after execution of the Final Order by the Regional Judicial Officer, on the date of filing with the Hearing Clerk.

[Remainder of Page Intentionally Left Blank

Complainant and Respondent will Each Sign on Separate Pages]

The foregoing Consent Agreement In the Matter of **Clean Harbors Tennessee, LLC**, Docket No. **TSCA-04-2022-3200(b)**, is Hereby Stipulated, Agreed, and Approved for Entry.

FOR COMPLAINANT:

Carol L. Kemker
Director
Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 4

In the Matter of:

Clean Harbors Tennessee, LLC

Respondent.

Docket No. **TSCA-04-2022-3200(b)**

FINAL ORDER

The Regional Judicial Officer is authorized to ratify this Consent Agreement which memorializes a settlement between Complainant and Respondent. 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.4(b) and 22.18(b)(3). The foregoing Consent Agreement is, therefore, hereby approved, ratified and incorporated by reference into this Final Order in accordance with the *Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits*, 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

The Respondent is hereby ORDERED to comply with all of the terms of the foregoing Consent Agreement effective immediately upon filing of this Consent Agreement and Final Order with the Regional Hearing Clerk. This Final Order disposes of this matter pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18 and 22.31.

BEING AGREED, IT IS SO ORDERED.

Tanya Floyd
Regional Judicial Officer

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order, in the Matter of **Clean Harbors Tennessee, LLC**, Docket No. **TSCA-04-2022-3200(b)**, were filed and copies of the same were emailed to the parties as indicated below.

Via email to all parties at the following email addresses:

To Respondent: Mr. James Childress
 VP Compliance East
 Clean Harbors Tennessee, LLC
 2815 Old Greenbrier Pike
 Greenbrier, Tennessee 37073
 Childress.james@cleanharbors.com

To EPA: Kris Lippert, Senior Enforcement Officer
 lippert.kristin@epa.gov
 (404) 562-8605

 Lynda Crum, Associate Attorney
 crum.lynda@epa.gov
 (404) 562-9524

 Robert Caplan, Senior Attorney
 caplan.robert@epa.gov
 (404) 562-9520

 U.S. EPA Region 4
 61 Forsyth Street, S.W.
 Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960

Shannon L. Richardson
Regional Hearing Clerk
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4
61 Forsyth Street, S.W.
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960